



Ymagineer

*Newsletter of the
International Machaut Society*

NUMBER 9

SPRING 1996

From the President

Greetings to all! It's a pleasure to welcome you as I assume the office of President, albeit in absentia due to my transatlantic relocation. We have another promising group of sessions on the program for Kalamazoo, with presentations on Machaut's poetic self-consciousness (Friday at 10 AM), poetic and musical analysis of his motets (Friday at 1:30), and the structure of his musical compositions (Friday at 3:30; all sessions in Fetzer 1060). I am especially pleased that our sessions this year include a contribution from one of our international members, Jacques Boogaart from the University of Utrecht.

I am sorry to be unable to attend this year's meeting—ironically, only the second that I have missed since the inception of the Society over ten years ago. But I look forward to making greater contact with Machaut scholars and performers this side of the Atlantic, and to spreading the word of our Society among them. Machaut studies are certainly alive and well here at Cambridge, and it has been a great pleasure meeting new colleagues, and renewing acquaintances with others. With the publication of so many new editions and translations in recent years, there is greater opportunity than ever before for teaching, study, and performance of works by Machaut and his contemporaries.

—Sylvia Huot (Cambridge)

This Year at Kalamazoo

FRIDAY, MAY 10

10:00 – “POETIC SELF-CONSCIOUSNESS IN MACHAUT: A ROUND TABLE” (Session 144, 1060 Fetzer)

1:30 – “MACHAUT AND THE ART OF MOTET” (Session 183, 1060 Fetzer)

12:00 – BUSINESS MEETING WITH BOX LUNCH (1060 Fetzer)

3:30 – “STRUCTURE IN MACHAUT'S MUSICAL COMPOSITIONS” (Session 223, 1060 Fetzer)

BOOK REVIEW:

Guillaume de Machaut: a Guide to Research

The reader may wonder why there is so little new bibliography in the current issue. The reason, of course, is the appearance late last fall of Lawrence Earp's volume, *Guillaume de Machaut: a Guide to Research*, Garland Composer Resource Manuals 36, Garland Reference Library of the Humanities 996 (New York and London: Garland, 1995). For the professor preparing a graduate seminar, as for the casual Machaut enthusiast, the *Guide* will quickly become the most important tool to appear since the various publications of the composer's musical and literary works.

One of the most striking features of the *Guide* is its enormous breadth. Unlike other volumes in the Composer Resource Manual Series, a work on Machaut requires fluency with the bibliography and scholarly debates of medieval literature, paleography, and art, in addition to music. Earp, who certainly possesses this fluency, offers us a concise and well-integrated synopsis of scholarship in these areas, organizing the eight chapters and 173-page bibliography that form the body of the *Guide* in a most useful fashion. Let me point to some of the features I have found most helpful in the few weeks since my copy arrived. The biographical information given in Ch. 1 rehearses and integrates the numerous discoveries that have come to light in recent decades with those given in Machabey's standard work of 1955. Not satisfied with simply synthesizing the secondary sources, however, Earp gives us a handy catalogue of the original documents in the footnotes. He subdivides much of this chapter into sections that revolve around Machaut's service to particular patrons.

The second chapter brings together scattered bits and pieces of information about Machaut's posthumous fame (snippets that used to escape my memory). Once again, Earp separates his material into literary and musical subheadings, and we are even treated to a list of modern musical works inspired by the composer. (I learned, for instance, that Berio's *A-Ronne* draws on *Ma fin est mon commencement*.)

The next two chapters deal with the specifics of the sources. Here, of course, Earp is thoroughly in his element, offering discussions not only of the complete-works manuscripts, but also of the more fragmentary sources, complete with extensive tabular material that allow us to trace the curriculum vitae of each work with ease. The miniatures follow in Ch. 4. Once again, Earp goes well beyond a list, providing comparative tables and concordances that allow us at a glance to see the dissemination of each picture.

The next three chapters are devoted to the composer's individual works, beginning with the narrative *dits* in Ch. 5. Here Earp establishes a template-type format that reappears in Ch. 7 on the music. The discussion treats many basic issues, including the form of a work, its appearances in the manu-

scripts, the location of facsimiles of its miniatures, along with editions, recordings, dates, patrons, and translations of the work. And by now it will come as no surprise that Earp far exceeds our usual expectations for a *catalogue raisonné*, for he also discusses anagrams (where applicable), explains how a work can contribute to our knowledge of Machaut's biography, outlines pertinent scholarly discussions from the historical and literary standpoints, lists related works by Machaut, cites literary antecedents and descendants, and even identifies the proverbs contained in the work (following J. Hassell, *Middle French Proverbs, Sentences, and Proverbial Phrases*, Subsidia Mediaevalia 12, Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies [Leiden: Brill, 1982]). Each of these chapters, moreover, begins with an exhaustive discussion of chronology and historiography. An introduction to the lyrical poetry (*Louange des dames*) comprises Ch. 6.

The discography (Ch. 8) incorporates precious information on performance practice, along with annotations to the individual recording titles. These annotations foreshadow Earp's similar offerings in the magnificent Bibliography. In addition to the voluminous published work on Machaut, Earp includes titles that can contribute to our understanding of the cultural backdrop: historical studies of the fourteenth century (e.g. Henneman 1971 and 1976), models of cathedral chapters of canonic life in northern France (e.g. Millet 1982, Pycke 1986, Starr 1987), to cite but two areas of enrichment. He likewise lists reviews of the more important works.

We all look forward to the updates of Machaut bibliography that come to us each year in *Ymaginer*. But this particular feature of *Ymaginer* will now change; henceforth these listings will serve as appendices to the firm foundation provided by the *Guide*. May we have the good fortune to see second and third editions of this work as Machaut studies continue to flourish.

In closing, I cannot resist citing one small, yet glaring, inaccuracy. Among the pages in the front material is one that bears the title "Garland Composer Resource Manuals." Here it is stated that "[t]his ongoing series encompasses more than 50 composers; they represent Western musical tradition from the *Renaissance* [italics mine] to the present century." It is difficult to imagine how the editors failed to modify their statement. True, this may be the first *medieval* volume of the series, but it does in fact exceed all of its Garland kin in size—to invoke but one criterion—by more than 100 pages! Clearly this is a most significant addition to the Garland lineup, the *vade mecum* for all future scholarship on the great poet and composer of the middle ages.

Gratias agimus Laurencio!

—Anne Robertson
University of Chicago

Reconstructing Machaut's Musical Works— Did They Ever Exist?

During the long years of my attempts to study the ficta in Machaut's works I have become increasingly aware that much broader issues are at stake beyond the important work done so far comparing manuscript variants and scribal practice (such as Jean Harden's important thesis). I now think that the ficta signs, in addition to their traditionally accepted function in preventing undesirable *mi contra fa*, and their role in forming exceptional progressions, as I have proposed in my previous papers, also reflect long-range harmonic planning, prolongations of progressions, and creation of expectations. For example, the much discussed designated b-flat in m 15 (Ludwig's edition) of ballade 31, *De toutes fleurs*, has been avoided in most recordings, except for the recent ones by Ensemble Organum and by John Fleagle. I see no scribal explanation for considering this flat as erroneous, and I think it forms a delay of the cadence prepared in m. 14, which is then reached in m. 16. Moreover, the disturbed cadence coincides with the painful word *vergier* in the first couplet and the accusation of Fortune in the second (as well as *cueillir* in the second strophe). Can we afford to ignore such precious information for the sake of smooth counterpoint? Furthermore, Prof. Margaret Bent kindly invited me to present my ideas at her superb discussion group in Oxford (February 23 1996) which led to the question whether the manuscript variants, including those of later sources such as E and Reina, reflect different contemporary interpretations of Machaut which are as legitimate as those of the repertory manuscripts. Moreover, was there any genuine Machaut version, which we may never prove, but at least strive for (as I believe), or only constantly changing and equally legitimate readings? I think we have reached a crucial stage in our Machaut research, and that open and thorough exchange of ideas, especially in interdisciplinary gatherings such as in Kalamazoo, is needed, especially before any new (and much needed) critical edition is conceived.

—Jehoash Hirshberg
Hebrew University



Conference News

At the 61st annual meeting of the American Musicological Society in New York (1–5 Nov. 1995), two papers in the session *Ars Nova: Theory and Practice* (chaired by Margaret Bent) were of interest to Machaut studies. Anne Walters Robertson (our vice-president) read “Machaut's *David Hocket* and the Coronation of Charles V.” Sarah Fuller read “Modal Discourse and Fourteenth-Century French Song.” Fuller continued her investigation of a theory of harmonic strategies in fourteenth century music in her paper “Exploring Tonal Structure in 14th-Century

Polyphonic Song,” read at the recent conference “Tonal Structures in Early Music” (University of Pennsylvania, 29-30 March). Abstracts of these three papers follow.

Abstract: Anne Walters Robertson, “Machaut's *David Hocket* and the Coronation of Charles V.”

Scholars have long associated Machaut's *David Hocket* with the Virgin Mary. While the tenor, taken from the Alleluia *Nativitas* for Mary, supports this explanation, four other features urge a new interpretation: (1) The tenor tag, “David,” which appears conspicuously in all voices, suggests the image of David as king; (2) Machaut's cathedral, Notre Dame of

(continued on folio verso)

Reims, contains an exceptional sculpture of David that reinforces its traditional function as coronation site; (3) a motive seen throughout the hocket mirrors the *laudesregiae* of Reims usage, royal acclamations chanted at crownings; and (4) the piece prominently displays the number three both in its triple rhythm and numbers of notes—123 longs, 369 breves (=3 x 123), and 1107 semibreves (=3 x 3 x 123).

These features argue for a political reading. Charles V, who knew Machaut personally, was anointed at Reims on Trinity Sunday 1364. He attempted to stabilize the precariously seated Valois dynasty by promoting an image that fused the concept of royal dignity symbolized in the Trinity with the age-old view of David as ideal king. His efforts produced a coronation *ordo* (GB:Lbm Cotton, Tibertius B. VIII) and a treatise on royal authority (*Le Songe du vergier*). These works drew from William of Ockham's *Octo questionum decisiones*, which justified kingship through analogy to David, and Philippe de Vitry's *Le Chapel des trois fleurs de lys*, which equated the "fleur" with the Trinity. This paper proposes that Machaut composed the hocket for Charles's coronation to embody the king's extraordinary vision of himself as "novus David."

Abstract: Sarah Fuller, "Modal Discourse and Fourteenth-Century French Song."

What kinds of interpretative frames should be brought to the study of fourteenth-century French polyphony? In a recent study, Christian Berger (*Hexachord, Mensur und Textstruktur: Studien zum französischen Lied des 14. Jahrhunderts*, Beihefte zum Archiv für Musikwissenschaft 35, Stuttgart: Steiner, 1992) asserts that pitch structure in fourteenth-century French polyphony is properly understood within the frame of the eight Western ecclesiastical modes. This belief not only controls his analytic and descriptive language but also guides his interpretation of *musica ficta*.

Careful examination of Berger's modal view reveals conceptual flaws on several fronts. My critique addresses the interpretation of theoretical documents, the reading of notation, and the premises behind analysis. I view modal theory as an explanatory system that involves specific musical phenomena within a culture, privileged features of those phenomena (often within the confines of genre or repertory), and

concepts that control those features under a framework of knowledge. Theory, that is, has a cultural dimension that extends beyond its bare technical elements and that must be considered in the move to analytic applications.

The modal approach to fourteenth-century French polyphony imposes a paradigm of modal coherence and rule-bound pitch organization and posits a smooth continuum of pitch regulation from plainsong to polyphony. In opposition to that view, I propose a conception that admits heterogeneous tonal space, shifts and ambiguities in tonal orientation, freedom from the conventions of plainchant modal theory. At issue is a real sense of "how the music goes"—how we edit, perform, and hear it.

Abstract: Sarah Fuller, "Exploring Tonal Structure in 14th-Century Polyphonic Song,"

As early as 1963, Gilbert Reaney proposed that French polyphonic song of the fourteenth century was conceived in terms of mode. Since that time, other scholars have wrestled with the issue of tonal structure in this repertory, but no broad consensus has been achieved. A typical approach has been to adopt a premise of modal integrity, tonal type, or hexacordal design. This presentation proposes an alternative approach that addresses tonal relations in 14th-century polyphonic song in terms of temporal process. As perceived in performance, songs delineate pitch loci—either individual tones or vertical entities—that form a network of hierarchical relationships. Melodic trajectories, formal boundaries of phrase units, rhythmic and mensural nuances, interplay between unstable and stable sonorities, and reiteration of pitch nodes all function to project specific pitch emphases that may be constituted as an image of tonal structure.

λ Analysis of Machaut's ballade *Pas de Tor* and comparison between its "performative" tonal structure and that of another song that Prof. Peter Lefferts assigns to the same tonal type indicates that a final pitch orientation may not sufficiently describe tonal structure within a piece and that external markers may be of limited utility in describing or predicting tonal behavior. This investigation bears upon the general issue of how scholars might formulate theories of tonal structure for this repertory that do justice to the actuality of pitch relationships as they emerge in performance.

Southampton Conference

The 23rd Conference on Medieval and Renaissance Music will be held at the University of Southampton 5-9 July 1996. In the session "Citation, Allusion and Imitation," Yolanda Plumley (Cork) will read "Musical Process and Intertextuality in the Late Fourteenth-Century Chanson: A Case Study." In the session "The Late Middle Ages," Jacques Boogaart (Utrecht) will present "Bridging Traditions: Machaut's motet 5 Reconsidered." In the session devoted to "The Fourteenth Century Motet," Alice V. Clark (Princeton) will read "New Tenor Sources," and Susan Fast (McMaster) will present "God, Desire and the Musical Narrative of Guillaume de Machaut's *De bon espoir/Puis que la douce/Speravi*." A round table discussion of Machaut Manuscript E will include three graduate students: Alison Bullock (Southampton), Liz Leach (Oxford), and Hannah Vlcek (Southampton).

Bibliography

- Bordessoule, Nadine. "De proies et d' ombres: écritures de la chasse dans la littérature française du XI^e siècle." Ph.D. diss. University of Pennsylvania, 1994. Ann Arbor, Mich.: University Microfilms. Order number 9503740. Hunting and its influence on fourteenth-century French literature. Abstract: *Dissertation Abstracts International A 55/9* (Mar. 1995): 2820.
- Clark, Alice V. "*Concordare cum materia*: The Tenor in the Fourteenth-Century Motet." Ph.D. diss. Princeton University, 1996. Alice defended on 8 February—congratulations!
- Earp, Lawrence M. *Guillaume de Machaut: A Guide to Research*. Garland Composer Resource Manuals 36. Garland Reference Library of the Humanities 996. New York and London: Garland, 1995. See Anne W. Robertson's review, this issue.
- Göllner, Marie-Louise. "Interrelationships between Text and Music in the Refrain Forms of Guillaume de Machaut." In *Songs of the Dove and the Nightingale: Sacred and Secular Music c.900–c.1600*, ed. Greta Mary Hair and Robyn E. Smith, 105-23. Basel: Gordon and Breach, 1995. "Although [Machaut] is primarily concerned with individual formal characteristics of his poems when setting them to music, the musical fabric does not serve simply to reinforce features of the poetry, but rather sets up a structure of its own to counterbalance that of the text" (105).
- Graf, Gebhard. *Ces trois un: Guillaume de Machauts "Lay de la fonteinne"*. Ph.D. thesis, Albert-Ludwigs-Universität zu Freiburg i. Br., 1993. Freiburg i. Br., 1993.
- Hahn, David C. "'Numerical Composition': a Study of Pythagorean-Platonic Ideas in the Making of the Rondeaux of Guillaume de Machaut." Ph.D. diss. Stanford University, 1993, Ann Arbor, Mich.: University Microfilms, 1995. Order number 9403948. Abstract: *Dissertation Abstracts International A 54/9* (Mar. 1994): 3256.
- Hindman, Sandra, and Stephen Perkinson. "Insurgent Voices. Illuminated Versions of Christine de Pizan's 'Le Livre du Duc des vrais amans.'" In *The City of Scholars: New Approaches to Christine de Pizan*, ed. Margarete Zimmermann and Dina De Rentiis, 221-31; 16 figs. European Cultures: Studies in Literature and the Arts 2. Berlin and New York: Walter de Gruyter, 1994. The cycles of miniatures in two MSS of the *Livre de Duc des vrais amans*, supervised by the author, directly contribute to her critique of the tradition of the *Roman de la Rose*. The identification of specific iconographical models and conventions includes miniatures in Machaut's *Voir Dit* and *Remede de Fortune*.
- Klaper, Michael. "'...prouver et demonstrier son refrain': Untersuchungen zur Refrain Behandlung in den Balladen Guillaume de Machauts." *Musiktheorie* 10 (1995): 99-117. Consideration of the relation of the refrain to the body of the strophe in many Machaut ballades, especially *Dame, de qui* (ballade of the *Remede*), *De toutes fleurs* (ballade 31), *Pour ce que tous* (ballade 12), *Esperance qui m'asseure* (ballade 13), and *Doulz amis* (ballade 6). Draws upon the few theoretical discussions of

- ballades set to music. Often the refrain concentrates basic musical elements upon which large parts of the strophe depend.
- Leech-Wilkinson, Daniel. "The Emergence of *ars nova*." *Journal of Musicology* 13 (1995): 285-317. Leech-Wilkinson is able to identify two composers (with followers) among the more modern works in the *Roman de Fauvel* (F:Pn fr. 146), one an experienced older composer, the "Master of the Royal Motets," the other likely Philippe de Vitry. He finally arrives at a nuanced view of several dated stages of development of the *ars nova*, from 1312 through the early 1320s, concluding that the fact that the *ars nova* "appeared so quickly does seem to point to the directing influence of a single powerful mind. The returning probability is that that mind was Vitry's." As for Machaut, he finds that the skill occasionally seen in Vitry's tenor layouts seems to be something that his pupil (?) Machaut learned.
- Lefferts, Peter M. "Signature-Systems and Tonal Types in the Fourteenth-Century Chanson." *Plain-song and Medieval Music* 4 (1995): 117-47. A classification of the entire repertory of fourteenth-century chansons—384 rondeaux, ballades, and virelais—according to a limited number of tonal categories.
- Leupin, Alexandre. *Fiction et incarnation: Littérature et théologie au Moyen Age*. Idées et Recherches. Paris: Flammarion, 1993. See chap. 9, "La désincarnation (Guillaume de Machaut)" (pp. 177-95), which concerns *Voir Dit*.
- Meulen, Janet F. van der. "De panter en de aalmoezenier. Dichtkunst rond het Hollands-Henegouwse hof." [The panther and the almoner. Poetry at the court of Holland-Hainaut] *Een Zoet akkoord. Middeleeuwse lyriek in de Lage Landen*, ed. Frank Willaert, 93-108. Nederlandse literatuur en cultuur in de middeleeuwen 7. Amsterdam: Prometheus, 1992. The influence of the *Dit de la panthère* on Machaut and others.
- Mullally, Robert. "The ballade before Machaut." *Zeitschrift für französische Sprache und Literatur* 104 (1994): 252-68. Close study of terminology and function of the refrain forms, based on the evidence of the extant sources. Throughout the thirteenth century and up to the *Roman de Fauvel*, the term *ballade* could mean any chanson with refrain. The *rondeau*, *virelai*, and *ballade* in the later sense of the word began to be recognizable from ca. 1300. Unlike the *virelai* and *rondeau*, it was quite rare to connect the ballade with dance.
- Plumley, Yolanda. *The Grammar of Fourteenth Century Melody: Stylistic Constraints and Compositional Strategies in the Ars Nova Chanson*. Outstanding Dissertations in Music from British Universities. New York and London: Garland, 1996. Publication of the author's 1990 University of Exeter dissertation, studying tonal system, pitch relations, and melodic patterning in the chansons of Machaut and the Chantilly codex.
- Sinnreich-Levi, Deborah M., ed. and trans. *Eustache Deschamps: L'Art de dictier*. Medieval Texts and Studies 14. East Lansing, Mich.: Colleagues Press, 1994. Introduction, new edition, and translation, a revision of the editor's 1987 dissertation.
- Wolfzettel, Friedrich. "Guillaume de Machaut: Dichter und Welt im Zeichen der Dame Rhétorique." *Wolfram-Studien XIII. Literatur im Umkreis des Prager Hofes der Luxemburger*. Schweinfurter Kolloquium 1992, ed. Joachim Heinzle et al., 42-57. Veröffentlichungen der Wolfram von Eschenbach-Gesellschaft. Berlin: Erich Schmidt, 1994. Even after the rehabilitation seen since Poirion's 1965 book, there is a palpable gulf between Machaut's contemporary fame and his current relative neglect. Wolfzettel evaluates Machaut's contribution to literary history based mainly on the *Prologue*.
- Wolfzettel, Friedrich. "Abundante Rhetorik: Selbstverständnis und historische Funktion der lyrischen Sprache von Machaut zu den *Grands Rhétoriciens*." In *Musique naturelle: Interpretationen zur französischen Lyrik des Spätmittelalters*, ed. Wolf-Dieter Stempel, 75-104. Romanistisches Kolloquium 7. Munich: Wilhelm Fink, 1995.

1995 Business Meeting Minutes

Nineteen members were present for the IMS Business Meeting, held on May 6 at Kalamazoo. Larry Earp, President, called the meeting to order at 12:45 p.m.

The first item to be discussed was selection of topics for 1996 sessions. The membership agreed on three topics: 1) Machaut's motets, to be organized by Sylvia Huot; 2) Machaut's musical compositions, to be organized by Jean Harden; and 3) poetic self-consciousness in Machaut, to be organized by Barton Palmer. It was decided that all correspondence regarding sessions should be sent to Barbara Altmann, IMS secretary, who would coordinate with Cynthia Valk the submission of forms to the Institute.

Several positions among the officers and on the board were open. Larry Earp's term as president having come to an end, the position goes, as is customary, to the current vice-president, namely Sylvia Huot. The position of vice-president, consequently vacant, required a musicologist. Several names were suggested, but a decision could not be made during the meeting, partly due to the absence of possible candidates. The membership voted to allow the Board to decide on and appoint the new vice-president. Anne Robertson was later asked to fill the post, and accepted.



Discography

Hyperion CDA66783. *The Spirits of England and France-3*. Gothic Voices. Christopher Page, director. Recorded March 1995. Texts; English translations. Although only one work by Machaut is included here, it is a significant one, a four-part chanson to my knowledge never before recorded: "Il m'est avis" (ballade 22).

Naxos (forthcoming). Machaut, *Messe de Notre Dame*. Oxford Camerata. Jeremy Summerly, director. Daniel Leech-Wilkinson wrote me enthusiastically recently (early April) about a recording of Machaut's Mass in Reims cathedral, done at just about the right spot, by two countertenors and two tenors. It has already been broadcast by the BBC, and is due on CD soon. "Fantastic acoustic, very unusual and brilliant for the music. Lots to think about." In the meantime, sample this group's superb 1994 recording of Dufay's *Missa L'homme armé* on the CD Naxos 8.553087.

-Lawrence Earp
University of Wisconsin-Madison



Society Dues

You will find a mark on the right-hand corner of your mailing label to indicate if you are paid up for 1995-96. A check mark means we *did* receive your contribution for the current year, an "X" means we didn't. Dues remain \$5.00 (US.) per year. Checks for dues owing should be made payable to *The International Machaut Society*. You may pay at the Business Meeting at Kalamazoo, or send your check to: Barbara K. Altmann, Secretary/Treasurer IMS, Department of Romance Languages, University of Oregon, Eugene, OR 97403.

Name: _____

Address: _____

Affiliation: _____



Ymaginer
Newsletter of the
International Machaut Society

To:

